



Grant Agreement no. 665948

Activity acronym: CIMULACT

Activity full name:

Citizen and Multi-Actor Consultation on Horizon 2020

## Executive summary

### Deliverable 5.3

#### Report on the impact of the project

Authors: Lenka Hebáková, Tomáš Rätinger, Luboš Jansa and Iva Vančurová

Organisation name of lead beneficiary for this deliverable: Technology Centre of the Czech Academy of Sciences (TC CAS)



Funded by the Horizon 2020  
Framework Programme of the  
European Union

## CIMULACT Partners

### TEKNOLOGIRÅDET – DANISH BOARD OF TECHNOLOGY (DBT)

Arnold Nielsens Boulevard 68E, 2650 Hvidovre – Denmark,  
Contact: Lars Klüver  
lk@tekno.dk  
[www.tekno.dk](http://www.tekno.dk)



**FONDEN TEKNOLOGI RÅDET**  
DANISH BOARD OF  
TECHNOLOGY FOUNDATION

### FRAUNHOFER GESELLSCHAFT ZUR FORDERUNG DER ANGEWANDTEN FORSCHUNG EV (ISI)

Breslauer Strasse 48, 76139 Karlsruhe – Germany  
Contact: Philine Warnke  
Philine.Warnke@isi.fraunhofer.de  
<https://www.isi.fraunhofer.de/>



### OESTERREICHISCHE AKADEMIE DER WISSENSCHAFTEN (ITA)

Apostelgasse 23, 1030 Vienna - Austria  
Contact: Niklas Gudowsky  
niklas.gudowsky@oeaw.ac.at  
<http://www.oeaw.ac.at/>



**INSTITUTE OF  
TECHNOLOGY  
ASSESSMENT**

### MISSIONS PUBLIQUES (MP)

35 Rue du Sentier, 75002 Paris – France  
Contact: Yves Mathieu  
Yves.Mathieu@missionspubliques.com  
<http://missionspubliques.fr/>



### STRATEGIC DESIGN SCENARIOS SPRL (SDS)

Rue Dautzenberg, 36-38, BE-1050 Brussels - Belgium  
Contact: François Jégou  
f.jegou@gmail.com  
<http://www.strategicdesignscenarios.net/>



strategicdesign  
scenarios.net

### TEKNOLOGICKE CENTRUM AKADEMIE VED CESKE REPUBLIKY (TC ASCR)

Ve Struhách 1076/27, 160 00 Praha 6-Bubeneč –  
Czech Republic  
Contact: Lenka Hebakova  
hebakova@tc.cz  
<http://www.tc.cz/cs>



**TEKNOLOGICKÉ  
CENTRUM AV ČR**

**ASOCIATIA INSTITUTUL DE PROSPECTIVA (Prospectiva)**

Bucharest, Sector 5, Aleea Sălaj no. 6,  
România, postal code 051907  
Contact: Radu Gheorghiu  
Gheorghiu.Radu.Christian@gmail.com  
<http://www.prospectiva.ro/>



**APPLIED RESEARCH AND COMMUNICATIONS FUND (ARC Fund)**

1113, Sofia 5, Alexander Zhendov St. Bulgaria  
Contact: Zoya Damianova  
Zoya.Damianova@online.bg  
<http://www.arcfund.net/>



**GREENDEPENDENT INTEZET NONPROFIT KOZHASZNU KORLATOLT FELELOSSEGU TARSASAG (GDI)**

2100 Gödöllő, Éva u. 4. , Hungary  
Contact: Edina Vadovics  
Edina@greendependent.org  
<http://www.intezet.greendependent.org/>



**POLITECNICO DI MILANO (POLIMI)**

Via Durando, 38a, 20158 Milano, Italy  
Contact: Anna Meroni  
Anna.Meroni@polimi.it  
<http://www.polimi.it/>



**THE ASSOCIATION FOR SCIENCE AND DISCOVERY CENTRES (SCIENCE)**

Suite 101, QC30, 30 Queen Charlotte Street; Bristol BS1 4HJ, United Kingdom  
Contact: Penny Fidler  
Penny.Fidler@sciencecentres.org.uk  
<http://sciencecentres.org.uk/>



**FUNDACIO CATALANA PER A LA RECERCA I LA INNOVACIO (FCRI)**

Paseo Lluís Companys, 23m Barcelona 08010 Spain  
Contact: Belén Lopez  
Belen.Lopez@fundaciorecerca.cat  
<http://www.fundaciorecerca.cat>



**AKADEMIEN DER WISSENSCHAFTEN SCHWEIZ VEREIN  
(TA Swiss)**

Brunngasse 36, CH-3001 Bern – Switzerland

Contact: Elise Gortchacow  
elise.gortchacow@ta-swiss.ch

[www.akademien-schweiz.ch](http://www.akademien-schweiz.ch)

Zentrum für Technologiefolgen-Abschätzung  
Centre d'évaluation des choix technologiques  
Centro per la valutazione delle scelte tecnologiche  
Centre for Technology Assessment



[www.ta-swiss.ch](http://www.ta-swiss.ch), Brunngasse 36, 3011 Bern

**HELSINGIN YLIOPISTO (UH)**

Fabianinkatu 33, 00014 Helsinki – Finland

Contact: Petteri Repo  
Petteri.Repo@helsinki.fi  
<https://www.helsinki.fi/fi>



HELSINGIN YLIOPISTO  
HELSINGFORS UNIVERSITET  
UNIVERSITY OF HELSINKI

**TEKNOLOGIRADET – THE NORWEGIAN BOARD OF  
TECHNOLOGY (NBT)**

Kongens Gate 14, N-0153 Oslo, Norway

Contact: Åke Refsdal Moe  
Ake.refsdal.moe@teknologiraadet.no  
<http://teknologiradet.no/>



**Teknologirådet**

**INSTYTUT TECHNOLOGII EKSPLOATACJI-PANSTWOWY  
INSTYTUT BADAWCZY (ITeE-PIB)**

ul. K. Pułaskiego 6/10, Radom 26-600, Poland

Contact: Beata Poteralska  
Beata.Poteralska@itea.radom.pl  
<http://www.itee.radom.pl/>



**ASOCIACIJA ZINIU EKONOMIXOS FORUMAS (KEF)**

Saulėtekio al. 15, LT-10221, Vilnius, Lithuania

Contact: Arminas Varanauskas  
Arminas@zef.lt  
<http://www.zef.lt/>



**SIA BALTIJAS KONSULTACIJAS (BC)**

Vīlandes 6-1, Rīga, LV-1010, Latvia

Contact: Sandra Smalina  
Sandra@granti.eu  
<http://www.balticconsulting.com/>



**UNIVERSITY COLLEGE CORK, NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF IRELAND, CORK (UCC)**

Western Road, Cork – Ireland  
Contact: Stephen McCarthy  
Stephen.mccarthy@ucc.ie  
<http://www.ucc.ie/>



**WAGENINGEN ECONOMIC RESEARCH**

Alexanderveld 5, 2585 DB Den Haag – Netherlands  
Contact: Volkert Beekman  
Volkert.Beekman@wur.nl  
[www.lei.wur.nl](http://www.lei.wur.nl)



**MEDIATEDOMAIN LDA (Mediatedomain)**

Rua Nery Delgado 9-1, P-2775-253 Parede – Portugal  
Contact: Ursula Caser  
ursicaser@gmail.com  
<http://uc-mediation.eu/>



**UNIVERSITA TA MALTA (UoM)**

Msida MSD 2080 – Malta  
Contact: Sandra M. Dingli  
Sandra.m.dingli@um.edu.mt  
<http://www.um.edu.mt/>



UNIVERSITY OF MALTA  
L-Università ta' Malta

**SLOVENSKA AKADEMIA VIED (SAS)**

Štefánikova 49, 814 38 Bratislava 1 - Slovakia  
Contact: Tomas Michalek  
Michalek@up.upsav.sk  
<https://www.sav.sk/>



**SLOVENIAN BUSINESS & RESEARCH ASSOCIATION (SBRA)**

Av. Lloyd George 6, 1000 Brussels, Belgium  
Contact: Draško Veselinovič  
drasko.veselinovic@sbra.be  
<http://www.sbra.be/>



Slovenian Business & Research Association

**RTD TALOS LIMITED (RTD Talos)**

P.O. BOX 21722, 1512 Lefkosia, Cyprus  
Contact: Melinda Kuthy  
mk@talos-rtd.com  
<http://www.talos-rtd.com/>



**4MOTION ASBL (4motion)**

10, rue du Commerce, L-4067 Esch/Alzett – Luxembourg  
Contact: Gary Diderich  
Gary@4motion.lu  
<http://www.4motion.lu/>

**ODRAZ - ODRZIVI RAZVOJ ZAJEDNICE (ODRAZ)**

Ul. kneza Ljudevita Posavskog 2, 10000, Zagreb – Croatia  
Contact: Lidija Pavic-Rogosic  
lidija@odraz.hr  
<http://www.odraz.hr/>

**STATENS GEOTEKNISKA INSTITUT (SGI)**

Månstorpsvägen 14, 263 32 Höganäs – Sweden  
Contact: Lisa Van Well  
Lisa.VanWell@swedgeo.se  
<http://www.swedgeo.se/>

**ATLANTIS SYMVOULEFTIKI ANONYMI ETAIREIA ATLANTIS CONSULTING (SA ATL)**

9th klm of Thessaloniki - Thermi, GR-570 01 – Greece  
Contact: Magda Chatzi  
chatzi@atlantisresearch.gr  
<http://www.atlantisresearch.gr/>



Legal notice:

The information in this document is provided as is and no guarantee or warranty is given that the information is fit for any particular purpose. The user thereof uses the information at its sole risk and liability. Neither the European Commission nor any person acting on behalf of the Commission is responsible for the use that might be made of the following information.

© CIMULACT 2018. Reproduction is authorised provided the source is acknowledged.

Disclaimer:

CIMULACT is a Horizon 2020 project funded by the European Commission. The views and opinions expressed in this publication are the sole responsibility of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the views of the European Com

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The project Citizen and Multi-Actor Consultation on Horizon 2020 (CIMULACT) aimed at improving the engagement of citizens in the process of formulation of the research agenda in Europe by providing inputs to the Horizon 2020 Work Programme (WP) 2018 – 2020 and consequently to the preparation of the Framework Programme 9 (FP9).

The CIMULACT project adopted co-creation and multi-actor procedures involving citizens and experts from 30 European countries. In the course of the project a number of intermediate results were gathered in key deliverables targeted to the needs of European and national research policy making. These deliverables included 179 citizens' visions, 48 research programme scenarios finally transformed into the final 23 research topics. This effort was acknowledged in the Interim Evaluation of Horizon 2020 where CIMULACT was mentioned as one example that had been already able to deliver significant inputs to Horizon 2020.<sup>1</sup>

This report (D5.3) assesses the impact of the CIMULACT project from two points of view:

- i) The impact on the European research agenda, particularly the use of the project outcomes in the process of designing the recent Work Programme of the Horizon 2020 (H2020 WP 2018 – 2020) and a possible further utilization of its results in the formulation of the FP9.
- ii) The impact on the partners of the project, including further uses of the methodology as well as co-creation and public engagement activities.

The first part of the report assesses impact of CIMULACT on the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020. The reference in the general introduction to H2020 WP 2018 – 2020 confirms the use of the results of the CIMULACT project in its formulation<sup>2</sup>. In order to provide deeper insight into the utilization of citizens' wishes and needs, the assessment proceeds in two ways: a) by comparing the final 23 citizen-based research topics<sup>3</sup> of the CIMULACT project with the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020 topics; b) by gathering opinions of research policy officers from various Commission services (DGs) on the actual use of the CIMULACT outcomes in the formulation of the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020 by means of an online survey and interviews.

---

<sup>1</sup> Interim Evaluation of Horizon 2020 Annex 2. Available at: [https://ec.europa.eu/research/evaluations/pdf/archive/h2020\\_evaluations/swd\(2017\)221-annex-2-interim\\_evaluation-h2020.pdf#view=fit&pagemode=none](https://ec.europa.eu/research/evaluations/pdf/archive/h2020_evaluations/swd(2017)221-annex-2-interim_evaluation-h2020.pdf#view=fit&pagemode=none)

<sup>2</sup> General introduction of the Horizon 2020 Work Programme 2018 – 2020. Available at: [http://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/h2020/wp/2018-2020/main/h2020-wp1820-intro\\_en.pdf](http://ec.europa.eu/research/participants/data/ref/h2020/wp/2018-2020/main/h2020-wp1820-intro_en.pdf)

<sup>3</sup> In this report we worked with the final 23 research topics that were elaborated at the Pan-European conference which was the final phase of the CIMULACT process



A clear overlap between 15 of the final 23 CIMULACT research topics and 22 topics from H2020 WP 2018 – 2020 was identified. It means that 65% of the CIMULACT research topics have been covered by the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020. The majority of the CIMULACT research topics referred to Work Programmes 1 (Health), 2 (Food security) and 6 (Europe in a changing world). No CIMULACT research topic corresponded explicitly to Work Programme 7 (Secure societies).

This thematic correspondence indicates the correspondence between citizens' wishes and needs, and the overall thematic focus of the European research agenda; however, this assessment does not provide any insight into unique contributions from CIMULACT to the final topics, in terms of perspectives not considered before the influence from CIMULACT. Neither does it reveal to what extent and way the CIMULACT research topics were specifically used in the formulation of the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020. In order to reveal that, a survey focused on the experience and opinions of research policy officers was carried out and several complementary interviews were conducted.

The respondents of the survey and interviews indicated that the approach of gathering and prioritizing citizens' wishes and needs adopted by CIMULACT was relevant and highly appreciated. They agreed that citizens are competent to suggest directions for research topics. Moreover, research topics based on needs and wishes of citizens can also help to distinguish between the real citizens' problems and political pressure.

Furthermore, interviews proved that the CIMULACT project affected the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020. It was also found that CIMULACT results served an important role as a justification of aspects of the most recent WP of H2020. The coverage of issues, their novelty and compatibility with other sources was appreciated.

The availability of the CIMULACT final results ten months prior to the publishing of the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020 enabled the responsible officers to ensure or gain confidence that the research agenda of the EU matched with citizens' interest and needs. The CIMULACT results provide support to the overall principle of H2020 that citizens have to have a say towards the research agenda as they produce unique input, besides that they are the ultimate beneficiaries of the invested research funds. This was also proved by the report on the comparison of CIMULACT research topics<sup>4</sup> with expert oriented foresight studies (Deliverable 5.2).<sup>5</sup> The Deliverable 5.2 showed that the themes of the CIMULACT topics generally were well represented within expert foresight studies (10 out of 16 studies include one or more references to research topics identified in CIMULACT), but that the CIMULACT

---

<sup>4</sup> In Deliverable 5.2 the analysis based on 46 topics (23 final topics and 23 potential ones)

<sup>5</sup> Deliverable 5.2: Report on comparison of research topics from CIMULACT with those from expert oriented foresight studies. Available at: [http://www.cimulact.eu/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/D5.2\\_Report-on-comparison-expert-oriented-foresight-studies-compressed.pdf](http://www.cimulact.eu/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/D5.2_Report-on-comparison-expert-oriented-foresight-studies-compressed.pdf)

topics added new and unique perspectives, especially on societal aspects, which were not represented in expert-based foresight.

The approached policy officers considered the CIMULACT as a good and helpful instrument for the engagement of citizens and the methodology adequate for trustworthy outputs and appreciated benefits of the genuine consultation process. They indicated a high demand for projects that would gather the views of citizens and build on public engagement processes in a systematic and transparent way as CIMULACT.

The survey and the interviews confirmed that the CIMULACT project proved to be a highly worthwhile and value-adding experience of public engagement and the demand for projects with the methodology like CIMULACT based on co-creation and utilising views of citizens would remain high. The impact of projects like CIMULACT on the formulation of research priorities might increase in the future, particularly if the timing of the project fits with the schedule of the development of a given research agenda within Framework Programme 9 – according to interviewees, CIMULACT outcomes are also relevant for the preparation of FP9. Also, if new FP supports the public engagement in R&I, projects like CIMULACT should be fully utilised in its formulation. Interviews revealed that projects that have an ambition to influence the formulation of R&I agendas should deliver their final results maybe even more than a year before publication of the agenda.

Generally, to increase the actual use of the project results, it is also necessary to put great effort on dissemination among and close collaboration with the policy makers and relevant EC policy officers. Although the overall outreach of the CIMULACT project has been large and its outcomes were disseminated among the Commission services and events were organized by the responsible project officer and CIMULACT partners, the awareness of the 23 CIMULACT research topics was limited likely due to lack of understanding of their high relevance to the research agenda in preparation. It would be important to develop ways to ensure that the relevant policy officers can be reached in time to increase the impact of projects like CIMULACT. For this purpose, the project officer and associated project officers need also be willing to put an effort into this task as the project partners have access to the EC policy officers only through their own project officer.

The second part of the report focuses on the assessment of the project procedures and their impacts on consortium partners. The assessment is based on feedback obtained from participants of the events and from “impact-targeted” questions regarding the actual and further use of co-creation/public engagement approaches as well as partners’ experience with stakeholders’ familiarization with the methods and results.

Citizens themselves, experts, national stakeholders and policy makers confirmed that citizens were able to provide interesting, valuable and plausible ideas about the future and corresponding research needs.

CIMULACT developed 11 new or adjusted participatory methods (summarized in an Inspiration catalogue<sup>6</sup>) which proved to be adequate during the project. These methods have already served as an inspiration as well as practical tools for researchers and other institutions interested in co-creation and public engagement.

Consortium partners gained new valuable experience in co-creation and public engagement. They had an exceptional opportunity to experiment with various methods under the guidance and supervision of the experienced partners. At least half of the project partners have already adopted the methods used in the course of the CIMULACT project and some of the partners have even applied whole methods or some of their aspects in their other work activities. Improved methodological knowledge, networking, acquirement of new recruitment approaches and facilitation skills belong among “other” benefits that the project brought to the consortium partners.

CIMULACT allowed bringing together citizens and experts in a close collaboration. It was an important experience particularly for initially sceptical scientists. New links and shared interests have emerged among project partners, and that resulted in new collaboration opportunities as well as in cooperation with various stakeholders.

Last but not least, the project paid important attention to dissemination and promotion in order to increase the impact of the CIMULACT project and its results. Effective dissemination activities helped enhancing interest of the project beneficiaries about the co-creation/public engagement approaches. The CIMULACT project was presented on many occasions at the regional, national and European levels (e.g. STOA Panel of the European Parliament or The 3<sup>rd</sup> European Technology Assessment Conference). OECD chose CIMULACT as one of a good practice case for engagement of citizens in open science agenda setting<sup>7</sup>. These activities helped to share the acquired knowledge on the practicality of co-creation/public engagement approaches with the research community and policy makers. They resulted in the establishment of new networks that can pursue co-creation/public engagement activities in the areas of R&I in the future.

### **Table 1 A selection of the achievements of the CIMULACT project**

The reference to CIMULACT in the General introduction of the Horizon 2020 Work Programme 2018 – 2020 as an input to the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020 and as an example of FP project enabling direct interactions with citizens

---

<sup>6</sup> Deliverable 5.1: Inspiration catalogue. Available at: [http://www.cimulact.eu/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/D5.1\\_Inspiration-Catalogue-for-consulting-different-groups-compressed.pdf](http://www.cimulact.eu/wp-content/uploads/2018/04/D5.1_Inspiration-Catalogue-for-consulting-different-groups-compressed.pdf)

<sup>7</sup> OECD Science, Technology and Innovation Policy Papers. No. 50. December 2017. Available at: <https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/docserver/74edb6a8-en.pdf?expires=1522742677&id=id&accname=guest&checksum=EEE39CAC6D6E363C36C104B2DA16741F>

CIMULACT presented in the Interim Evaluation of Horizon 2020 as a project that had already produced significant inputs into Horizon 2020
15 of 23 research topics with thematic overlap in 22 topics of the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020
The CIMULACT project affected the H2020 WP 2018 – 2020 and in some cases CIMULACT research topics led to a concrete WP 2018 – 2020 call or specific parts of the call (findings based on interviews with policy officers)
CIMULACT has added important aspects to the EU research agenda by providing new future-oriented perspectives to themes under the Grand Challenges
The CIMULACT citizen-based topics had unique qualities as compared to expert foresight studies (findings from Deliverable 5.2)
CIMULACT was chosen by OECD as one of a good practice case for engagement of citizens in Open Research Agenda Setting
CIMULACT outcomes remain relevant for the preparation of Framework Programme 9
CIMULACT developed 11 new or adjusted participatory methods (summarized in the Inspiration catalogue)
Most of the CIMULACT Consortium partners already adopted new/adjusted participatory methods in their working activities
Consortium partners gained or improved skills in areas of methodological knowledge, acquirement of new recruitment approaches and facilitation
New (working) networks within the consortium and between individual partners and national institutions, stakeholders were established
Large overall outreach of the CIMULACT project: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- around 902 dissemination activities of consortium partners</li> <li>- 4 reviewed scientific publications</li> <li>- 126 presentations at workshops and conferences</li> </ul>
Two presentations at an OECD workshop on Open Science (June 2017, Seoul): 1) methods and experience with Open Agenda Setting; 2) the CIMULACT project
CIMULACT presented within intro to the session on The Future of Science through Citizens Engagement at the STOA Panel of the European Parliament (March 2017, Brussels)
CIMULACT presented within session on Responsible Research Agendas at The 3 <sup>rd</sup> European Technology Assessment Conference (May 2017, Cork)
CIMULACT presented at a conference on the Future of the Research System to 450 Norwegian research administrators, politicians and university representatives (March 2017, Oslo)

# FROM CITIZENS' VISIONS TO FUTURE EU RESEARCH AND INNOVATION AGENDA

